Nationwide Evaluation of Health Care Prices Paid by Private Health Plans: Findings from Round 3 of an Employer-Led Transparency Initiative

Employer’s Forum of Indiana National Conference
September 18, 2020

Christopher Whaley, Brian Briscombe, Rose Kerber, Brenna O’Neill, Aaron Kofner
Outline

- Background
- Study approach
- Study findings
  - Indiana-specific results
  - Procedure-specific prices
- Implications & conclusions
Outline

Background

Study approach

Study findings

• Indiana-specific results
• Procedure-specific prices

Implications & conclusions
Acknowledgments

• Funding provided by the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation and participating employers

• Study conceptualized by Employer’s Forum of Indiana

• The study team:

  Rose Kerber  Aaron Kofner  Brenna O’Neill  Brian Briscombe  Christine Gallagher

Employer-sponsored plans cover half of Americans

$1.2 trillion health care costs in 2018

$480 billion hospital costs in 2018

160 million people
Prices paid by employers are rising rapidly

Trends in Case-Mix Adjusted Inpatient Hospital Prices

- Private Insurance
- Medicare
- Medicaid

Source: CMS Hospital Cost Report Data
Why should we care about health care spending?

What do we know already?

- Prices paid by private health plans are higher and growing faster than Medicare.
- Increases in spending are driven by price growth, not utilization.
- Prices vary widely from market to market, and from hospital to hospital within markets.
What do we not yet know?

• How do prices compare across the country?
• Are hospital prices continuing to rise?
• Which hospitals/systems are getting the highest prices?
• What are the prices that individual self-funded employers are paying, and are these prices in line with the value that employers are getting?
Self-funded employers have a fiduciary responsibility

- Fiduciaries have a responsibility to “act solely in the interest of plan participants and their beneficiaries and with the exclusive purpose of providing benefits to them.” (Department of Labor)

- How can self-funded plans fulfill fiduciary obligations without knowing prices?
Hospital prices in the time of COVID-19

• COVID-19 is placing enormous financial pressure on both hospitals and employers
• Hospitals and health professionals are critical members of their communities
• Health benefits are one of the largest expenses for employers
• Now more than ever, employers need transparent information about hospital prices
Why did RAND undertake this study?

- We do not know what the “right” price is for hospital care
- Self-funded employers cannot act as responsible fiduciaries for their employees without price information
- Employers can use the information in this report—together with knowledge of their own employee populations—to decide if the prices they and their employees are paying align with value
Rand's hospital study journey:

**Phase 1.0**

- Just Indiana
- employers
- facility fees
- relative prices
RAND’s hospital study journey:

**Phase 1**
- Just Indiana
- employers
- facility fees
- relative prices

**Phase 2.0**
- 25 states
- employers, health plans, and 2 APCDs
- inpatient/outpatient
- facility fees
- relative and standardized prices
RAND’s hospital study journey:

**Phase 1**
- Just Indiana
- employers
- facility fees
- relative prices

**Phase 2**
- 25 states
- employers, health plans, and 2 APCDs
- inpatient/outpatient
- facility fees
- relative and standardized prices

**Phase 3.0**
- 49 states (excluding Maryland)
- employers, health plans, and 6 APCDs
- inpatient/outpatient
- facility and professional fees
- service-line prices
Outline

Background

Study approach

Study findings
  • Indiana-specific results
  • Procedure-specific prices

Implications & conclusions
Obtain claims data from:
- self-funded employers
- APCDs
- health plans

Measure prices in two ways:
- relative to a Medicare benchmark
- price per case-mix weight

Create a public hospital price report:
- posted online, downloadable
- named facilities & systems
- inpatient prices & outpatient prices

Create private hospital price reports for self-funded employers
Comparing prices can be challenging

• Every hospital is different and performs different services

• The Medicare system can help us standardize and make an “apples-to-apples” comparison

• So let’s make an apple pie—but with two recipes
Recipe #1: Percent of Medicare

• What do employers pay relative to what Medicare would have paid at the exact same hospitals?

• Easy to interpret and compare across hospitals

• Medicare adjusts for cost of living and wage differences
Recipe #2: **Standardized prices**

- Medicare has figured out how much more to pay for different services
  - e.g., Medicare pays 34.65 times for a heart transplant (DRG 103) than for chest pains (DRG 143)
  - we can use these weights to make an apples-to-apples comparison across hospital services
  - average "walk out the door" amount

- Don’t have to worry about teaching, DSH, etc. payments
Comparison to Medicare

• We leverage the Medicare payment system as a **benchmark**, not as a price endpoint

• Medicare prices and methods are empirically based and transparent

• Benchmarking to Medicare allows employers to compare prices between hospitals, relative to the largest purchaser in the world
Data protections

• This study was regulated by RAND’s Human Subjects Protection Committee

• We conducted our data analysis in a secure computing environment—similar to the environment used to analyze confidential Medicare data

• RAND data analysts undergo HIPAA and human subjects training

• NDAs and DUAs were put in place to protect data confidentiality
Outline

- Background
- Study approach
- Study findings
  - Indiana-specific results
  - Procedure-specific prices
- Implications & conclusions
Commercial prices relative to Medicare have increased steadily.

Relative price for inpatient and outpatient hospital care.

- 2016: 224%
- 2017: 230%
- 2018: 247%
Commercial prices relative to Medicare vary widely across states.
Facility prices relative to Medicare, by state:
Professional prices relative to Medicare, by state:
In many states, there is a gap between professional and facility fees.
Prices vary widely within states
And also within hospital systems

Relative price for inpatient and outpatient care

Eastern Maine Healthcare Systems
Baylor Scott & White Health
Prime Healthcare
Network Healthcare
UCHealth
PenBay Medical
Providence Health
CATHS
HCA Healthcare
OSF Healthcare System
OhioHealth
Texas Health Resources
RWJBarnabas Health
Sutter Health

And also within hospital systems
Some link between price and quality, but many high quality hospitals with low prices.
Patient mix doesn’t explain price variation
Outline

- Background
- Study approach
- Study findings
  - Indiana-specific results
  - Procedure-specific prices
- Implications & conclusions
Indiana hospital system prices: inpatient + outpatient

Price Relative to Medicare (%)
Indiana hospital system prices: inpatient
Outline

- Background
- Study approach
  - Indiana-specific results
  - Procedure-specific prices
- Study findings
- Implications & conclusions
Indiana hospital prices: inpatient orthopedic procedures.
US hospital prices: inpatient orthopedic
US hospital prices: labor and delivery
Indiana hospital prices: inpatient circulatory
US hospital prices: inpatient circulatory
Indiana hospital prices: inpatient respiratory procedures
Indiana hospital prices: outpatient
Indiana hospital prices: outpatient emergency department
### Indiana hospital system prices: outpatient imaging (CT/MRI)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Price Relative to Medicare (%)</th>
<th>Standardized Price ($)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>250%</td>
<td>$500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500%</td>
<td>$1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>750%</td>
<td>$1,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The chart above illustrates the range of prices for outpatient CT/MRI procedures across various Indiana hospital systems, compared to Medicare rates. The x-axis represents the price relative to Medicare, while the y-axis shows the standardized price in dollars.
Outline

Background

Study approach

Study findings
  • Indiana-specific results
  • Procedure-specific prices

Implications & conclusions
How can employers use price transparency?

- Finally have information about prices
- Benchmark prices
- Change hospital networks
Employers are collecting information about prices

- The Colorado Business Group on Health used RAND 2.0 data to produce a report on value of Colorado hospitals
- The report proposed options for Colorado employers to address prices in their specific markets
Employers are using data to benchmark prices

Anthem’s home state innovation
A similar RAND study commissioned by self-insured employers in Indiana spurred action when researchers concluded that Hoosier companies paid hospitals an average of 272% of Medicare rates from 2013 to 2016.

In response, 12 self-insured companies asked Anthem Blue Cross and Blue Shield to develop new health plan options that would steer members to lower-cost, high-quality providers, as alternatives to their traditional PPOs with wide-open networks. Up to that point, Indiana employers had been reluctant to limit their workers’ provider choices for fear of backlash, said Gloria Sachdev, CEO of the Employers’ Forum of Indiana.

Harris Meyer (2020) “Self-insured employers go looking for value-based deals” Modern Healthcare
And they’re citing RAND’s study in their negotiations

Anthem is attempting to support a core goal of the RAND study by holding hospital systems accountable for their prices, which in turn will benefit our employees' mental and physical health and their financial wellness.

—Purdue Senior Director of Benefits
Role for state and federal policymakers

Market structure limits ability for employer innovation
• many markets have limited provider options
• 70% of U.S. markets are concentrated (HCCI, 2019)

Employers can also push for regulatory reforms
• all-payer claims databases
• policies that promote competition and eliminate gag clauses
• limits on out-of-network charges
• all-payer or global budget programs
Conclusions

• Rising health care costs place pressure on employers and worker wages—especially during the COVID-19 pandemic

• The wide variation in hospital prices presents a potential savings opportunity for employers

• Employers need to demand transparent information on the prices they—and their employees—are paying

• Employers need to use transparency to inform benefit strategy
Christopher Whaley
cwhaley@rand.org